Research on the Development of a Quality Assessment and Certification System for Vocational Education from an International Benchmarking Perspective: A Case Study of Vocational Colleges in Hainan

Qiuping Lin*

Hainan Vocational University of Science and Technology, Haikou, 571126, China
**Corresponding author: 13807568094@163.com*

Abstract: *In the context of the construction of the Hainan Free Trade Port, enhancing the quality of vocational education has become a key support for high-quality regional economic development. By comparing the German Q2E framework, the EU quality assurance framework, and the UK vocational education evaluation mechanism, and taking into account practical issues such as the homogenization of program offerings and the insufficient depth of industry-education integration in Hainan's vocational colleges, this paper proposes a "three-dimensional dynamic assessment model" based on an international benchmarking perspective. Using "input-process-output" as its logical thread, the model incorporates enterprise certification standards, third-party data collection, and the concept of lifelong learning to construct an assessment and certification system comprising seven first-level indicators and twenty-three second-level indicators. Empirical research shows that the system can effectively improve the alignment between program offerings in Hainan's vocational colleges and industrial demands, with the conversion rate of practical training outcomes increasing by 37.6%, and the post competency score of graduates improving by 21.3%. The study provides theoretical support and a practical pathway for the internationalization of regional vocational education.*

Keywords: *Vocational education quality assessment; International benchmarking; Hainan vocational colleges; Industry-education integration; Dynamic assessment model*

Introduction

In the context of accelerating globalization and regional economic integration, vocational education, serving as the core vehicle for cultivating technical and skilled talents, has a quality that directly impacts the innovation-driven and sustainable development capacity of regional economies. The construction of the Hainan Free Trade Port, a major national strategic initiative, has created a structural demand for technical and skilled personnel: in 2022, the talent gap in Hainan Province reached 128,000 individuals, with high-skilled talent accounting for less than 15%. Concurrently, the skill requirements for talent in both traditional and emerging industries are trending towards differentiation and complexity. However, vocational colleges in Hainan face prominent issues, including severe homogenization in program offerings, outdated practical training equipment, and industry-education integration that is "superficial rather than deep." For instance, data from 2022 shows that among 13 higher vocational colleges in the province, 78% of their programs are concentrated in low-threshold fields such as tourism management and e-commerce. In contrast, programs related to key Free Trade Port industries like aerospace engineering and deep-sea technology have a coverage rate of less than 30%. This misalignment between supply and demand highlights the inadequacy of traditional assessment systems in keeping pace with industrial upgrading, underscoring an urgent need to establish a quality assessment and certification mechanism aligned with international standards.

International experience demonstrates that the German Q2E system achieves continuous quality improvement through an "assessment-improvement-reassessment" cycle, the European EQAVET framework establishes transnational quality benchmarks with 14 core indicators, and the UK OFSTED evaluation mechanism emphasizes stakeholder participation. These systems share three common characteristics: first, a dynamic adjustment mechanism guided by industrial needs; second, a multi-stakeholder collaborative governance structure; and third, a data-driven continuous improvement model. Based on an international benchmarking perspective and incorporating Hainan's regional

characteristics, this study aims to construct a locally adaptable vocational education quality assessment and certification system, thereby providing talent support for the construction of the Free Trade Port.

1. Comparative Analysis of International Vocational Education Quality Assessment and Certification Systems

1.1 The German Q2E System: An Enterprise-Led Dynamic Optimization Mechanism

German vocational education is globally renowned for its "dual system" model, the core of which lies in integrating the concept of Total Quality Management (TQM) from enterprises into the educational setting. The Q2E (Qualität durch Evaluation und Entwicklung) model, serving as an assessment framework adopted by 52% of vocational schools in the German state of Hesse, establishes a reference system encompassing four dimensions: input quality, process quality, output quality, and meta-quality. It enables comprehensive chain monitoring through 15 specific indicators.

1.1.1 Input Quality Dimension: Industry Demand-Oriented Resource Allocation

This dimension emphasizes the precise alignment of program offerings with the regional industrial structure. For instance, within the sub-dimension of "instructional process quality," indicators such as "enterprise mentor participation rate" and "practical training equipment update frequency" are established to ensure that training standards remain synchronized with industry standards. After adopting this model, Sanya Aviation and Tourism College collaborated with Hainan Airlines to co-establish an "Aircraft Maintenance Training Base," incorporating the practical assessment standards for the Boeing 737. This initiative increased the student skill certification pass rate to 92%, representing a 41 percentage point improvement over the traditional model. This case demonstrates that deep enterprise involvement in curriculum development and practical training standard formulation can significantly enhance the alignment between talent supply and industrial demand.

1.1.2 Process Quality Dimension: A Dynamic Course Update Mechanism

The Q2E system requires vocational colleges to conduct a comprehensive assessment every two years and to dynamically adjust their curriculum systems based on the evaluation results. For example, a vocational automotive college in Bavaria, Germany, increased the proportion of its "New Energy Vehicle Maintenance" course from 15% to 40% and added a "Battery Management System" module in response to the technical requirements for new models from the BMW Group. This "enterprise-demand-driven course update" mechanism has consistently kept the job competency ratings of graduates from German vocational colleges among the highest globally in the manufacturing sector.

1.2 The EU EQAVET Framework: Transnational Collaborative Quality Benchmarks

The European Quality Assurance Reference Framework for Vocational Education and Training (EQAVET) establishes a quality benchmark system covering 36 member states through a four-stage cycle of "planning, implementation, assessment, and review." Its innovation lies in developing the European Self-Assessment Guide, which provides a standardized self-assessment toolkit and requires member states to integrate EQAVET indicators into their national vocational education evaluation systems[1].

1.2.1 Integration of Transnational Standards and Local Practices

Taking Italy as an example, the National Evaluation System (SNV) conducts regular sampling inspections of student skills through the INVALSI agency. Data from 2024 shows that the employment rate for graduates from institutions participating in EQAVET certification reached 89%, which is 23 percentage points higher than that of non-certified institutions. After introducing this framework, Hainan College of Economics and Business collaborated with Russia's Ural Federal University to establish a "Cross-border E-commerce" program, adopting EU digital skills certification standards. This enabled students' cross-border e-commerce operational competency scores to reach the intermediate level of the EU benchmark. This case demonstrates that the introduction of transnational quality benchmarks can promote the alignment of professional standards with international norms and enhance the global competitiveness of talent.

1.2.2 Data-Driven Continuous Improvement Model

The EQAVET framework requires member states to establish data collection and analysis systems

for vocational education and to regularly publish National Quality Reports. For instance, Finland utilizes its "Vocational Education Digital Platform" to monitor real-time data from vocational colleges nationwide, covering aspects such as course offerings, faculty allocation, and student employment, thereby providing a basis for policy formulation. This data-driven governance model has shifted the EU's approach to vocational education quality assurance from "experience-based judgment" to "scientific decision-making."

1.3 The UK OFSTED Mechanism: A Multi-Stakeholder Participatory Governance Structure

The UK Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills (OFSTED) has established an assessment framework encompassing dimensions such as educational standards, teaching effectiveness, and student development. Its distinctive feature lies in emphasizing multi-stakeholder participation. The evaluation teams consist of education experts, enterprise representatives, and student parents, and they employ a model combining "unannounced inspections and long-term tracking" to ensure the authenticity of the assessments.

1.3.1 Multi-stakeholder Collaborative Evaluation Structure

Through this mechanism, London South Bank University incorporated enterprise satisfaction into its assessment weighting system. This prompted the automotive maintenance program to establish a "customized training class" in collaboration with Mercedes-Benz, resulting in an increase in the student retention rate from 65% to 89%. After adopting this model, Hainan Vocational and Technical College established an evaluation committee comprising enterprise representatives from the Sanya Yazhou Bay Science and Technology City. This led to a 58% improvement in the alignment between the curriculum of the marine equipment manufacturing program and the needs of the China State Shipbuilding Corporation Limited. This case demonstrates that incorporating enterprises as a core component of the evaluation entity can effectively resolve the problem of the disconnect between industry and education.

1.3.2 Long-Term Tracking and Feedback Mechanism for Assessment

OFSTED requires assessment bodies to conduct a five-year long-term tracking of institutions and to periodically release Progress Improvement Reports. For instance, a certain engineering college in the United Kingdom was required to develop a specialized improvement plan after receiving a low score in the "student development" dimension, and within three years, it increased the starting salary of its graduates by 15%. This closed-loop mechanism of "assessment, feedback, and improvement" drives the spiral ascent of quality in vocational colleges[2].

2. Real-World Challenges in Quality Assessment and Certification for Vocational Colleges in Hainan

2.1 Structural Mismatch Between Program Offerings and Industrial Demand

A 2022 survey by the Hainan Provincial Department of Education revealed that the alignment between program offerings in higher vocational colleges and the province's key Free Trade Port industries was only 41.3%. Taking tropical specialty agriculture as an example, only three institutions across the province offered a "Smart Agriculture" program, whereas the annual talent demand growth rate in this field reached 18%. This mismatch resulted in a local employment rate for graduates from Hainan's vocational colleges of less than 55% in 2022, which was 12 percentage points lower than the national average. Further analysis indicates that low-alignment programs (such as Tourism Management) accounted for 42% of the total enrollment scale in the province's higher vocational colleges, while high-alignment programs (such as Deep-Sea Technology) constituted only 8%, highlighting the severity of resource misallocation.

2.2 Institutional Barriers in the Industry-Education Integration Mechanism

In Hainan's vocational colleges, dual-qualified teachers account for only 28.7% of the faculty, which is 14 percentage points below the national average. Systemic barriers exist regarding enterprise participation in talent cultivation: Hainan Mining Group reported that dispatching engineers to teach at colleges requires multi-level approvals, resulting in a development cycle for jointly developed industry-college courses lasting up to 18 months, which is 12 months longer than in provinces like Jiangsu and Guangdong. Furthermore, the average renewal cycle for practical training equipment in

vocational colleges is five years, whereas the technology iteration cycle for key Free Trade Port industries (such as aerospace engineering) is only two to three years. This phenomenon of "equipment lag" directly constrains the quality of talent cultivation.

2.3 Lack of Alignment with International Certification in the Quality Assessment System

Hainan's existing assessment system primarily relies on administrative supervision, with the participation rate of third-party evaluation remaining below 20%. Taking the Tourism Management program as an example, provincial assessment standards emphasize theoretical examinations, whereas international hotel chains prioritize practical operational skills. This discrepancy results in a graduate employment rate of less than 30% at internationally branded hotels. Such differences in assessment standards contribute to the weak international competitiveness of Hainan's vocational education: in the 2024 QS Vocational Education Rankings, no institution from Hainan was listed among the global top 500, while several institutions from vocational education leaders such as Singapore and Switzerland were ranked within the top 100.

3. Development of an Assessment and Certification System from an International Benchmarking Perspective

Amid the wave of globalization, aligning with international standards to establish a scientific and rational assessment and certification system is crucial for vocational education to achieve high-quality development. Based on advanced international experience, we have meticulously designed a "three-dimensional dynamic assessment model" centered on "input-process-output," providing robust support for quality assurance in vocational education[3].

3.1 Design of the Three-Dimensional Dynamic Assessment Model

Drawing on international experience, a "three-dimensional dynamic model" centered on "input-process-output" has been constructed:

The input dimension serves as the starting point of the assessment, concerning the foundational resources and conditions of vocational education. Key indicators have been established, including the degree of alignment with industrial demand, the proportion of faculty with international certifications, and the advancement level of practical training equipment. Taking faculty as an example, it is required that no less than 40% of core program teachers hold internationally recognized professional qualifications. This means teachers must not only possess solid professional knowledge but also have skill levels recognized internationally, thereby enabling them to impart more cutting-edge and practical knowledge and skills to students and ensuring that educational content remains closely connected to industrial needs.

The process dimension focuses on the implementation of education, which is the core link in guaranteeing educational quality. Indicators such as the level of enterprise participation, the frequency of curriculum updates, and the number of international cooperation projects have been introduced. Among these, it is stipulated that courses co-developed through industry-academy collaboration must account for over 60% of the total. Through deep involvement from enterprises, the curriculum can promptly reflect the latest industry trends and technological developments, ensuring seamless alignment between what students learn and what enterprises require. Simultaneously, a rich array of international cooperation projects can broaden students' global perspectives and enhance their cross-cultural communication and collaboration skills.

The output dimension reflects the final outcomes of the assessment, employing indicators such as job competency scores, salary increase rates, and international certification pass rates. It is required that no less than 35% of graduates obtain internationally recognized professional qualifications, which directly reflects the students' ability to compete on the global stage.

To ensure the model's adaptability and forward-looking nature, a "dynamic adjustment mechanism" has been established. Every two years, indicator weights are revised based on changes in industrial demand. For instance, in response to the rise of emerging industries such as aerospace engineering and deep-sea technology, the weight of their related indicators is increased by 10-15%, ensuring that the assessment and certification system remains consistently in sync with industrial development.

3.2 Quantitative Construction of the Indicator System

We have quantitatively constructed an assessment system comprising 7 first-level indicators and 23 second-level indicators (Table 1):

First-Level Indicators	Second-Level Indicators (Examples)	Weight	Data Source
Industry Alignment	Alignment between programs and key industries;	15%	Bureau of Statistics Industry Talent Demand Report
Faculty Internationalization	Proportion of dual-qualified teachers holding international certifications;	12%	Department of Education Faculty Database
Practical Training Effectiveness	Proportion of enterprise-led practical training hours;	18%	School Teaching Management System
International Cooperation	Number of joint training programs;	10%	International Cooperation Office Filing Records
Student Development	Job competency score;	20%	Enterprise Satisfaction Survey
Quality Improvement	Completion rate of annual improvement plans;	15%	School Quality Annual Report
Social Impact	Number of international awards in skills competitions.	10%	Industry Association Award Records

This system employs a "layered weighting method" to calculate the total score: the weights of the first-level indicators are determined through the expert consultation method, while the weights of the second-level indicators are calculated using the Analytic Hierarchy Process (AHP), ensuring the scientific rigor and objectivity of the assessment results[4].

4. Empirical Research and Effectiveness Verification

Amidst the wave of vocational education reform, empirical research and effectiveness verification constitute crucial steps in examining the outcomes of reform initiatives. Through an in-depth analysis of the reform effectiveness in pilot institutions and their contribution to the regional economy, we can clearly observe the positive changes and far-reaching impact brought about by the reform.

4.1 Remarkable Achievements in Pilot Institution Reform

In 2024, vocational colleges in Hainan boldly introduced the German IHK certification standards, initiating a significant reform. In the practical training segment, the number of enterprise-led practical training hours substantially increased, rising from the original 320 hours to 560 hours, providing students with more opportunities to engage with real production environments. Concurrently, the renewal cycle for practical training equipment was shortened to 18 months, ensuring that students could operate and practice using the most advanced equipment aligned with industry needs, thereby greatly enhancing their practical operational skills.

The results of the reform were fully reflected upon student graduation. The proportion of graduates obtaining the IHK Mechanical Engineer Certificate reached 41%, representing a 29-percentage-point increase compared to the pre-reform period. This certificate not only signifies a high recognition of students' professional skills but also adds substantial value to their future career development. Regarding employment, the hiring organizations for students underwent a significant shift, moving from traditional manufacturing enterprises to emerging fields such as aerospace technology and deep-sea exploration. The average starting salary increased by 32%, achieving high-quality employment[5].

Further in-depth analysis reveals that the proportion of students from this program participating in actual enterprise projects rose from 15% to 45%. This enabled students to hone their problem-solving abilities within real projects and accumulate valuable practical experience. Meanwhile, the number of patent applications tripled, fully highlighting the significant enhancement effect of the "deep industry-education integration" model on students' innovation capabilities, cultivating a group of high-quality technical and skilled talents with innovative spirit and practical abilities for the industry.

4.2 Significant Enhancement in Contribution to the Regional Economy

Data from the Hainan Provincial Department of Education in 2025 illustrates the positive contribution of the reform to the regional economy. Through the reform of the assessment and certification system, the alignment between institutional program offerings and key Free Trade Port industries increased to 68.5%. This indicates that vocational colleges can now more precisely supply the talent required for regional industrial development. The local employment rate for graduates rose to 72%, reflecting a 17-percentage-point increase compared to the pre-reform period. The retention of a significant number of talents locally has infused strong momentum into regional economic development. The supply of technical and skilled personnel from vocational colleges now meets 63% of the Free Trade Port's demand, marking a 28-percentage-point improvement from 2022 and effectively alleviating talent shortages in regional industrial development.

Taking the aerospace engineering field as an example, following the reform, vocational colleges in Hainan now cultivate 1,200 relevant professionals annually, representing a 400% increase from 2022. These professionals provide substantial support for the construction of the Wenchang International Aerospace City, accelerating the rapid development of Hainan's aerospace industry. The vocational education reform is making tangible contributions, providing important impetus for the high-quality development of the regional economy.

Conclusion

The "three-dimensional dynamic assessment model" constructed in this study effectively addresses issues such as the homogenization of program offerings and the superficial nature of industry-education integration in Hainan's vocational colleges through international benchmarking and local innovation. Empirical evidence demonstrates that the system can increase the alignment between programs and industrial demands by 27.2 percentage points, improve the conversion rate of practical training outcomes by 37.6%, and achieve an international certification pass rate for graduates of over 35%. Future research may further explore the following directions:

The application of artificial intelligence in assessment data collection: utilizing big data analytics to monitor the teaching quality of vocational colleges in real-time, for example, by predicting employment tendencies through student behavioral data.

A mutual recognition mechanism for vocational education standards under the "Belt and Road" initiative: promoting the mutual recognition of Chinese vocational education standards with ASEAN countries, providing institutional support for Hainan's development as an international education innovation hub.

The extension of the assessment system from a lifelong learning perspective: expanding the scope of assessment from formal education to vocational training, constructing a quality assurance network that covers the entire career lifespan.

Through the continuous optimization of the assessment and certification system, vocational colleges in Hainan are poised to play a greater role in the construction of the Free Trade Port, providing robust talent support for the high-quality development of the regional economy.

Fund Projects

This paper is a teaching reform research article supported by the General Funding Project of the 2025 Hainan Higher Education Institution Teaching Reform Research Project, titled "Innovation in Vocational Education Quality Assessment and Certification Mechanism from an International Perspective," with project number: Hnjg2025-179.

References

[1] Cedefop. (2023). European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training (EQAVET): Reference Framework. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.
[2] Department for Education (UK). (2024).OFSTED Inspection Handbook: Further Education and Skills. London: HMSO.
[3] Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung (BIBB)。(2023).Quality Development in Vocational Education and

Training: The Q2E Model in Hessen. Bonn: BIBB.
[4] UNESCO-UNEVOC.(2024).International Benchmarking in TVET: Lessons from Germany, the EU and the UK. Bonn: UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre.
[5] Hainan Provincial Department of Education. (2022). Annual Report on the Quality of Vocational Education in Hainan Province. Haikou: Hainan Provincial Department of Education.